Developing Effective and Sustainable Assessment Plans

Assessment Workshop

October 19, 2018
Accreditation, Assessment, and Evaluation (AAE)
Institutional Effectiveness
Opening Remarks

Dr. Carolinda Douglass
Vice Provost for Institutional Effectiveness
Introductions

- AAE Team - Institutional Effectiveness
- Table Introductions - within your groups
- Burning questions - Report out
Group Introductions

Introduce yourself to your group members and share why you chose to attend this workshop.

In your role within your program/unit, do you have a burning question about assessment?
Assessment Workshop: Goals

Participants will:

1. Gain a comprehensive understanding of the overall “Assessment Framework”

2. Acquire knowledge in developing and evaluating programmatic student learning outcomes (SLOs)

3. Infer how a *curriculum map* can be used to develop an effective assessment plan
Assessment Workshop: Goals

Participants will:

4. Apply acquired knowledge in aligning SLOs with methods to collect evidence

5. Experience consensus building within their teams as they apply assessment skills in developing a sample assessment plan

6. Discuss ideas and questions related to assessment with peers
Agenda

- 8:00 a.m. – 8:30 a.m. Check-In and Kickoff
- 8:15 a.m. – 8:25 a.m. Opening Remarks- Dr. Carolinda Douglass
- 8:25 a.m. – 8:45 a.m. Workshop Agenda and Introductions
- 8:45 a.m. – 9:10 a.m. Assessment Framework
- 9:10 a.m. – 10:00 a.m. Activity #1: Developing SLOs
- 10:00 a.m. - 10:05 a.m. 1st Break
- 10:05 a.m.- 10:40 a.m. Curriculum Mapping
- 10:40 a.m. – 10:50 a.m. – 2nd Break and TRIVIA answers
- 10:50 a.m. – 11:40 a.m. Activity #2: Aligning Methods to Developed SLOs
- 11:40 a.m. – 11:55 a.m. Data Placemats
- 11:55 a.m. – Noon. Wrap-Up and Closing Remarks
Housekeeping

• What to Expect
  – Individual and Group Activities
  – Active participation
  – Breaks are built-in

• Content Covered
  – Overall Assessment Framework
  – Emphasis on developing an effective Assessment Plan
  – Generalizability across degree programs and support units

• Resources in Folder
Common Language

- Mission
- Program Assessment Plan
- Evaluation
- Student learning Outcomes
- Objectives
- Standards
- Curriculum Map
- Rubrics
Common Language

Program-level Student Learning Outcomes

Course-level Student Learning Outcomes

Learning Objectives

Please cite as: Northern Illinois University (2018). Developing Effective and Sustainable Assessment Plans
Assessment Framework

Student Learning Outcomes (SLO)

- Develop SLOs
- Identify Methods
- Collect Data and Information
- Data-Informed Decisions
Steps in Program Assessment

Step 1: Identify program standards
Step 2: Develop program goals/competencies
Step 3: Identify student learning outcomes
Step 4: Identify assessment methods
Step 5: Set student and program-level targets
Step 5: Collect data and information
Step 6: What are the data telling you about student learning?
Step 6: Review progress and areas for growth
Step 7: Act when, how, and where needed
Step 8: Revise plan where needed
• Why do we focus on assessing student learning?
• What are Student Learning Outcomes (SLOs)?
• What are some ways to assess various SLOs?
• Am I responsible for assessing SLO’s?
• How is SLO assessment relevant to my teaching or research?
• Can data regarding SLOs benefit faculty? students? program?
• What resources exist if I need help?
What is a Student Learning Outcome?

• A Student Learning Outcome (SLO) describes what students will know and be able to do at the end of the program

• Key Characteristics
  – Observable/measurable
  – Sufficiently detailed -- explain what student will learn and how they will demonstrate learning in the field/discipline
  – Manageable
  – Distinguished from other programs
  – Clear to individuals outside of the field/discipline
When developing Student Learning Outcomes (SLOs...)

• Identify what **specific** knowledge, skill, or attitude will be developed
  
  – **Cognitive**- What should students know?  
    [Facts, theories, applications, strategies, processes]
  
  – **Behavioral**- What should students be able to do?  
    [Demonstrable skills, performance at a specified level]
  
  – **Affective**- How should students be able to feel/value?  
    [Attitudes, motivation]

• Specify the **measurable** student behavior that will demonstrate learning

• Consider *relationship of your course to the degree program or baccalaureate student learning objectives*
How is data on SLOs useful?

- **Students**
  - Clear objectives enhance commitment
  - Feedback on progress can modify behaviors
- **Faculty / Instructor**
  - Guide curricular improvements (content, method, process)
- **Program**
  - Comprehensive coverage of SLOs across curricular and extra curricular experiences
- **Other Stakeholders**
  - Regional, programmatic, and disciplinary accreditations
  - Program review and continuous improvement
Group Activity #1: Revise SLOs

• B.S. Real Estate Program: Evaluate
  – Are the student learning outcomes well-defined?
  – How can the SLOs be improved so they capture essential skills, knowledge, attitudes you want your graduates to demonstrate?
  – Report out- 2/3 observations per group
Selecting methods that are most appropriate to provide data and information on each of the program’s SLOs

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Old SLOs</th>
<th>Your Group’s Revised SLOs</th>
<th>Methods</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Understand how to make real estate decisions.</td>
<td></td>
<td>•</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Understand how to optimally invest in growth and development opportunities, prepare for and manage the problems that occur when a real estate venture turns out to be unideal, and improve the energy efficiency of the infrastructure of revenue-generating properties.</td>
<td></td>
<td>•</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Perform well in an internship that involves exposure to the ethical norms and legal norms of real estate.</td>
<td></td>
<td>•</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Successfully communicate in a variety of ways, including written and oral, as well as in-person and online.</td>
<td></td>
<td>•</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Network with other professionals to obtain accurate predictions of CAPEX and OPEX for real estate ventures.</td>
<td></td>
<td>•</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Activity 1 Instructions:** 1. Revise the “Old SLOs” to improve them.

**Activity 2 Instructions:** Select methods that will be most effective in addressing each SLO.

Please cite as: Northern Illinois University (2018). Developing Effective and Sustainable Assessment Plans
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Revised SLOs</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Analyze market and economic data to forecast real estate trends so students can make prudent investment decisions.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Identify development opportunities with revenue-generating properties that are amenable to improvements in energy efficiency.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Create value in real estate while respecting all ethical and legal norms, with full awareness of responsibility to communities, investors, and users.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Successfully communicate the merits of beneficial real estate projects to various stakeholders.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Network with local, regional, and international professionals to gather market data, perspectives, investment ideas, and employment leads.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Activity Instructions:** 1. Revise the “Old SLOs” to improve them; 2. Select methods that will be most effective in addressing each SLO.
**What Is a Curriculum Map?**

A curriculum map is a tool/technique that shows some meaningful concepts about your curriculum at-a-glance, such as what is taught, as well as when and how. Furthermore, some mapped courses may provide you with measures to use for assessment.

The “What”: course content, areas of emphasis, learning outcomes

The “How”: learning opportunities and resources for students

The “When”: use a timetable to review the curriculum sequence

What are “assessment measures”?: Tools that demonstrate students’ achievement of the expected learning outcomes, which reflect the program’s mission and quality.

**What Do You Need to Create a Curriculum Map?**

- The program’s student learning outcomes (SLOs).
- Course syllabi
- Possible indicators of the alignment between your SLOs and curriculum:
  1. Course syllabi (and the course learning objectives listed in the syllabi)
  2. Course catalogs
  3. Self-reports from faculty members and students, including surveys
  4. Assessment methods you already use
  5. Student work examples (e.g., portfolios, assignments)

**What are the Benefits of a Curriculum Map?**

- Transparency about the program’s content and structure
- Showing the alignment between the program’s curriculum and mission
- Identification of gaps, redundancies, and misalignments in the curriculum
- Showing the progression of difficulty in the program, which demonstrates whether students are appropriately challenged
- Showing that students are receiving adequate coverage of your program’s SLOs

**I Made a Curriculum Map! What Now?**

Consider the following...

- Does your curriculum cover all necessary content and progress logically (in terms of course difficulty)?
- Is your curriculum transparent to all stakeholders, including faculty, students, accreditors, and other communities of interest?
- Do your faculty understand how their courses fit into the program’s SLOs?

If your program needs to improve in any of these areas, then your curriculum map can get you started! It is an invaluable tool for improving and communicating about your program!

Please cite as: Northern Illinois University (2018). Developing Effective and Sustainable Assessment Plans
B.S. in Real Estate Curriculum Map

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Course and Title</th>
<th>SLO #1</th>
<th>SLO #2</th>
<th>SLO #3</th>
<th>SLO #4</th>
<th>SLO #5</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>RES 300 General Concepts in Real Estate</td>
<td></td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RES 320 Real Estate Statistics</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>D</td>
<td>B</td>
<td>B</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RES 332 Geographical Variations in Property</td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>B</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RES 352 Urban Development</td>
<td></td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RES 370 Forecasting and Appraisal</td>
<td></td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RES 390 Residential Appraisal</td>
<td></td>
<td>D</td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RES 400 Agricultural Property Development</td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RES 458 Property Management Internship</td>
<td></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>D</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RES 460 Acquisition Practicum</td>
<td></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>RES 470 Real Estate Case Studies</td>
<td></td>
<td>P</td>
<td>P</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Here are some problems we found with this curriculum map...

1) No 200-level core courses are mapped.
   - Students should build their skills throughout the entire program, including early on!

2) SLO#2 is not covered at the “Beginning” level.
   - Even if this is a higher-level skill, it still needs to be covered at a foundational level. Also, it is over-covered.

3) SLO #5 is only covered in one course, and it is not covered at the “Proficient” level.
   - Perhaps “Networking” skills are primarily obtained through internships and other co-curricular opportunities.
   - If so, then “Networking” could be focused upon in other courses as well within the program’s designed curriculum.

---

The Mapping Process

Step 1: Identify which SLOs are invoked by a course.
(Use something to highlight the cell as a placeholder)

Step 2: Identify the level of expertise promoted by the course
(B = Beginning; D = Developing; P = Proficient)

---

Please cite as: Northern Illinois University (2018). Developing Effective and Sustainable Assessment Plans
TRIVIA ANSWERS!
Selecting Assessment Methods: Let’s think this through...

- **Alignment between SLO(s) and Assessment Methods**
  - Is my chosen method assessing specific SLOs?
- **Number of assessment methods per SLO**
  - Is there some triangulation to validate findings?
- **Number of SLOs being assessed by each method**
  - Am I relying on a single method to assess all learning objectives?
- **Type of Assessment Method**
  - Direct/Indirect?
  - Formative/Summative?
- **Data/Information provided by the assessment**
  - Are these data useful in informing me how students are experiencing the program?
Connect Methods to SLOs…

• Content Knowledge (Cognitive)
  – Problem Sets, Tests, Comprehensive Exam
  – Papers, case study analysis

• Skills (Behavioral)
  – Projects, papers, presentations
  – Experiences, internships, simulations, student teaching, service learning
  – Performances

• Attitudes (Affective)
  – Reflection papers, surveys
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Method</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Example</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Course-Embedded Assignment</td>
<td>This is a direct assessment method that involves using existing student coursework as data for the assessment of a learning outcome.</td>
<td>A student presentation addressing “stakeholder needs in a location when purchasing property” - completed in RES 400 Agricultural Property.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Capstone Project</td>
<td>This is a direct assessment method that utilizes a capstone project to integrate knowledge and skills students have acquired throughout their program.</td>
<td>A team project (with research and writing) involving the development of a local unused property - completed in RES 470 Real Estate Case Studies.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reflective Student Essays</td>
<td>Reflective essays demonstrate students’ understanding and opinions about course content/internship/practicum etc.</td>
<td>Essay prompt: “Many stakeholders are interested in salvaging old properties while making them more energy-efficient. How would you optimize energy-efficiency, despite working with an old infrastructure?” - completed in RES 460 Practicum Course.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portfolio</td>
<td>Students’ work (e.g., presentations, research papers, tests) is collected throughout a program and assessed by faculty using a common rubric.</td>
<td>A portfolio from several courses containing presentations, market analysis samples, and simulation cases involving property sales will be evaluated against a rubric containing specific criteria – completed toward the end of the program.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comprehensive Exam</td>
<td>An exam given near the end of student’s academic career that assesses their ability to integrate knowledge/skills across their entire discipline.</td>
<td>A written 4-hour exam includes sections that reflect all course content studied thus far, including the following: real estate statistics, real estate law and ethics, and real estate-specific concepts/terminology - completed in last semester of the program.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Performance Evaluation</td>
<td>Students are evaluated on their performance in projects, clinical experiences, music/art performances, etc.</td>
<td>Real Estate majors’ case study projects are evaluated, in which the cost of a real estate property was estimated (including taxes) - completed in RES 458 Internship course.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pre- &amp; Post-Tests</td>
<td>Exams are administered at the beginning and end of a course to show how students’ content knowledge changed over time.</td>
<td>After their sophomore-level courses, students are given a pre-test regarding typical real estate calculations. After their senior-level courses, a similar set of questions are given to students as a post-test.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Internship Survey</td>
<td>Internship supervisors convey students’ professional attitudes and whether they are satisfactorily skilled.</td>
<td>Survey item #1: “Overall, the student seems ready to network with other real estate professionals.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Survey item #2: “The student communicated in a way that was consistent with the ethical/legal expectations that exist for real estate professionals.”</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Please cite as: Northern Illinois University (2018). Developing Effective and Sustainable Assessment Plans**
Group Activity #2: SLO-Methods Alignment

- Review the “Assessment Methods” sheet in your folder
- Individually, select appropriate methods for each SLO
- Discuss with your group and collaborate to complete the online document as a unit
- Select a volunteer to report out
  - What methods did you select?
  - Why did you select these methods?
### Activity Instructions:
1. Revise the “Old SLOs” to improve them; 2. Select methods that will be most effective in addressing each SLO.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Revised SLOs</th>
<th>Methods</th>
<th>D/I; S/F</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Analyze market and economic data to forecast real estate trends so students can make prudent investment decisions.</td>
<td>Portfolio, Perform. Eval. (RES 485 Internship), Comp. Exam (real estate statistics), Cert. Exam (finance, real estate calculations)</td>
<td>D, S, D, S, D, S</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Identify development opportunities with revenue-generating properties that are amenable to improvements in energy efficiency.</td>
<td>Capstone (RES 470 Case Studies), Reflective Essays (RES 460 Practicum), Course Evaluations (RES 352 Urban Development)</td>
<td>D, S, D, F, I, F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Create value in real estate while respecting all ethical and legal norms, with full awareness of responsibility to communities, investors, and users.</td>
<td>Cert. Exam (agency contracts, marketing regulations), Comp. Exam (real estate law and ethics), Internship Survey (Survey item #2)</td>
<td>D, S, D, S, D, F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Successfully communicate the merits of beneficial real estate projects to various stakeholders.</td>
<td>Comp. Exam (real estate concepts/terminology), Course-Etended (RES 400 Agricultural Property), Reflective Essays (RES 460 Practicum)</td>
<td>D, S, D, F, D, F</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5. Network with local, regional, and international professionals to gather market data, perspectives, investment ideas, and employment leads.</td>
<td>Internship Survey (Survey item #1), Exit Interview (Interview question #2), Alumni Survey (Survey item #2)</td>
<td>D, F, I, S, I, S</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Please cite as: Northern Illinois University (2018). Developing Effective and Sustainable Assessment Plans
Data Analysis: Data Placemats

What do you observe?

• **How are the data disaggregated?**
  – Graphs focusing on student level targets
    • Can be created from raw data in tables
  – Student characteristics, rubric criteria, etc.
    • “Networking with clients” questions were disaggregated by race

• **How are different methods connected?**
  – Similar types of data: Alumni survey questions and Internship survey questions
    • Internship supervisors gave students more “Excellent” ratings than they gave themselves
    • Patterns of “Excellent” ratings differed between each race category
  – **Different types of data**
    • Students may want different emphases (notes in the Exit survey) because the IL Real Estate Exam has multiple subsections for different professionals
Effective and Sustainable Assessment Plans...

• Are based on clear, explicitly stated student learning outcomes
• Involve faculty and staff discussion and collaboration at the unit level
• Use multiple measures that allow for triangulation of findings
• Assess outcomes and processes to achieve those outcomes
• Involve data-informed decisions for continuous improvement
• Make assessment process ongoing, not episodic
• Avoid perfection and are modified as needed
Effective and Sustainable Decisions are...

- Faculty-based and discussed at the unit level
- Shared with stakeholders to leverage successes
- A result of fine-tuning and low cost efforts as an outcome of discussions
  - Agreement to cover concept more explicitly in one or more courses
  - Rubrics are modified to make them more clear
  - Sequence of curriculum is changed
  - SLOs are reviewed and modified

***Not every piece of evidence demands improvement***
Individual Reflection

- How does the information I have learned today connect with my program’s assessment plan?
  - Are my program’s SLO’s well-developed and comprehensive?
  - Are we using adequate methods to collect information on these?
  - Can we improve my program’s assessment plan?
  - Overall, is my program’s assessment plan effective and sustainable?
Thank You!

Please contact AAE if you have any lingering questions!