

Professor Danny Unger
Tuesdays, 6:30-9:10
Office hours, T,W,Th 2-3

Fall 2011
DuSable 464
POLS 661 (672-1)

Comparative Historical Analysis of Politics

This course considers the contributions made to comparative politics by analyses rooted in a conviction that “time is fateful.” We draw on readings from history, sociology, and political science, giving attention to methodological issues that social scientists face in qualitative comparative-historical studies. The course begins with a focus on these methodological concerns before moving on to consider a variety of efforts to understand diverse macro-social phenomena such as state and regime formation and revolution.

Required text:

-James Mahoney and Dietrich Rueschemeyer, eds. *Comparative Historical Analysis in the Social Sciences* (Cambridge, 2003)

Course requirements:

All students are expected to participate in class discussions.	
General participation	30
Discussion papers and role as seminar leader(distribution to seminar)	30
Issues to address in papers: How useful are the key concepts presented in the readings? How are the concepts related to other concepts in the field? What policy or theoretical implications are suggested by the approach used in the reading? Does the reading help identify fruitful areas for future research?	
There will be at least two leaders per week.	
In-class final exam	40

Schedule of Meetings and Readings

August 23, **Introduction**

August 30, **Overview, theory and methods**

-James Mahoney and Dietrich Rueschemeyer, "Comparative Historical Analysis: Achievements and Agendas," in Mahoney and Rueschemeyer, eds. *Comparative Historical Analysis in the Social Sciences* (Cambridge, 2003) pp.3-40

-Julia Adams, Elisabeth Clemens, Ann Orloff, "Social Theory, Modernity, and the Three Waves of Historical Sociology," in Julia Adams, Elisabeth Clemens and Ann Orloff, eds. *Remaking Modernity: Politics, History and Sociology* (Duke University Press, 2005)

-William H. Sewell, Jr., *Logics of History. Social Theory and Social Transformation* (University of Chicago, 2005)pp.1-21, 81-107

Supplementary:

-Skocpol, "Sociology's Historical Imagination," in Skocpol, ed. *Vision and Method in Historical Sociology* (Cambridge, 1984)

-William H. Sewell, Jr., "A Theory of Structure: Duality, Agency, and Transformation," *American Journal of Sociology*, 98, 1992, pp.1-29

Suggested:

-Theda Skocpol, "Emerging Agendas and Recurrent Strategies in Historical Sociology", 1984

-Andrew Abbott, "Against Narrative: A Preface to Lyrical Sociology," *Sociological Theory*, 25:1, 2007

-Abbott, "History and Sociology: The Lost Synthesis," *Social Science History*, 15:2, 1991

-Arend Lijphart, "The Comparable-Cases Strategy in Comparative Research," *Comparative Political Studies*, 8:2, 1975, pp.158-75

September 6, **Methods I**

-Craig Calhoun, "The Rise and Domestication of Historical Sociology," in T.J. McDonald, ed. *The Historic Turn in the Social Sciences* (Ann Arbor: Michigan University Press, 1996)

-Dietrich Rueschemeyer, "Can One or a Few Cases Yield Theoretical Gains?" in Mahoney and Rueschemeyer eds. *Comparative Historical Analysis*, 2003, pp.305-36

-Peter A. Hall, "Aligning Ontology and Methodology in Comparative Politics," in Mahoney and Rueschemeyer, *Comparative Historical Analysis*, 2003, pp.373-406

-James Mahoney, "Strategies of Causal Assessment in Comparative Historical Analysis," in Mahoney and Rueschemeyer, *Comparative Historical Analysis*, 2003, pp.337-72

-James Mahoney, "Knowledge Accumulation in Comparative Historical Research: The Case of Democracy and Authoritarianism," in Mahoney and Rueschemeyer, *Comparative Historical Analysis*, 2003, pp.131-74

-David Collier, Henry E. Brady, and Jason Seawright, "Sources of Leverage in Causal Inference:

Toward an Alternative View of Methodology," in Brady and Collier, eds. *Rethinking Social Inquiry: Diverse Tools, Shared Standards* (New York: Rowman and Littlefield,) pp.250-64

Supplementary:

- Charles Tilly, "To Explain Political Processes," *American Journal of Sociology*, 100, 1995, pp.1594-1610
- Michael Burawoy, "Two Methods in Search of Science," *Theory and Society*, 18, 1989, 759-805
- John Gerring, *Case Study Research: Principles and Practices* (Cambridge University Press, 2007) pp.17-63
- Alexander L. George and Andrew Bennett, *Case Studies and Theory Development in the Social Sciences* (MIT Press, 2004) 205-62
- Stanley Lieberman, "Small N's and Big Conclusions: An Examination of the Reasoning in Comparative Studies Based on a Small Number of Cases," *Social Forces*, 70:2, pp.307-20
- "Symposium: Universal vs. Middle-Range Theory," *APSA-CP*, 17:2, 2006, pp.7-21

Suggested:

- Sewell, "Historical Events as Transformations of Structures: Inventing Revolution at the Bastille," *Theory and Society*, 25:6, 1996, pp.841-81
- Dylan Riley, "The Historical Logic of Logics of History: Language and Labor in William H. Sewell, Jr.," *Social Science History* 32:4, pp.555-65
- James Mahoney, "Nominal, Ordinal, Narrative Appraisal in Macrocausal Analysis," *American Journal of Sociology*, 104, 1999, pp.1154-69
- James Mahoney and Celso M. Villegas, "Historical Enquiry and Comparative Politics," in Carles Boix and Susan C. Stokes, eds. *Oxford Handbook of Comparative Politics* (Oxford University Press, 2007)
- Gary King, Robert O. Keohane, Sidney Verba, *Designing Social Inquiry* (Princeton University Press, 1994)
- Margaret Levi, "An Analytic Narrative Approach to Puzzles and Problems," in Ian Shapiro et al. eds. *Problems and Methods in the Study of Politics* (Cambridge University Press, 2004) Ch. 10
- Skocpol and Margaret Somers, "The Uses of Comparative History in Macrosocial Inquiry," *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 22:2, pp.174-97
- William H. Sewell, Jr., "Three Temporalities: Towards an Eventful Sociology," in T.J. McDonald, ed. *The Historic Turn in the Social Sciences* (Ann Arbor: Michigan University Press, 1996)

September 13, **Methods II**

- Philip Gorski, "The Poverty of Deductivism," *Sociological Methodology*, 34, 2004, 1-33
- James Mahoney and Gary Goertz, "A Tale of Two Cultures: Contrasting Quantitative and Qualitative Research," *Political Analysis*, 14:3, 2006, pp.227-49
- James Mahoney, "Toward a Unified Theory of Causality," *Comparative Political Studies*, 41:4/5, 2008, pp.412-36
- James Mahoney, "After KKV: The New Methodology of Qualitative Research," *World Politics*, 63:1, 2011
- Paul Pierson, "Big, Slow-Moving, and ...Invisible: Macrosocial Processes in the Study of Comparative Politics," in Mahoney and Rueschemeyer, *Comparative Historical Analysis*, 2003, pp.177-207

-Ira Katznelson, "Periodization and Preferences," in Mahoney and Rueschemeyer, *Comparative Historical Analysis*, 2003, pp.270-304

Supplementary:

-Kathleen Thelen, "How Institutions Evolve: Insights from Comparative Historical Analysis," in Mahoney and Rueschemeyer, *Comparative Historical Analysis*, 2003, 208-40

-Jeffrey Haydu, "Making Use of the Past: Time Periods as Cases to Compare and as Sequences of Problem Solving," *American Journal of Sociology*, 104:2, 1998, pp.339-71

-Paul Pierson, "Increasing Returns, Path Dependence, and the Study of Politics," *American Political Science Review*, 94, 2000, pp.251-67

-Sharon Hays, "Structure and Agency and the Sticky Problem of Culture," *Sociological Theory*, 12:1, 1994, pp.57-72

-George Steinmetz, "The Epistemological Unconscious of U.S. Sociology," in Julia Adams, Elisabeth Clemens and Ann Orloff, eds. *Remaking Modernity: Politics, History and Sociology* (Duke University Press, 2005)

Suggested:

-Paul Pierson, *Politics in Time: History, Institutions, and Social Analysis* (Princeton University Press, 2004) pp.17-53

-James Mahoney, "Path Dependence in Historical Sociology," *Theory and Society*, 29:4, 2000, pp.507-48

-James Mahoney, *Path Dependence and Regimes in Central America*

-Kathleen Thelen, "Historical Institutionalism in Comparative Politics," *Annual Review of Political Science*, 2, 1999, pp.369-404

-Larry J. Griffin, "Narrative, Event-Structure Analysis, and Causal Interpretation in Historical Sociology," *American Journal of Sociology*, 98:5, 1993, pp.1094-1133

September 20, **State building I**

-Perry Anderson, *Lineages of the Absolutist State* (London: Verso, 1974) Foreword, Chs.1-2

-Charles Tilly, *Coercion and Capital in European States*, 1992, Preface, 1-33, 67-95

-Brian M. Downing, *The Military Revolution and Political Change: Origins of Democracy and Autocracy in Early Modern Europe* (Princeton University Press, 1992) Chs.2, 4

-Francis Fukuyama, *The Origins of Political Order. From Prehuman Times to the French Revolution* (New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux, 2011) pp.262-75

Supplementary:

-Michael Mann, *The Sources of Social Power*, vol. I to 1760, pp.416-49, 500-517

-Fernando Lopez-Alves, on Tilly, in Miguel Angel Centeno and Alves, eds. *The Other Mirror*, pp.153-76

-Dominguez, on Huntington, in Miguel Angel Centeno and Fernando Lopez-Alves, eds. *The Other Mirror*, pp.219-39

September 27, **State building II**

-Thomas Ertman, *Birth of the Leviathan: Building States and Regimes in Medieval and Early Modern Europe* (New York: Cambridge, 1997) Chs.4-5

-Martin Shefter, *Political Parties and the State* (Princeton University Press, 1994) 3-18, 61-98, 169-94

- Tuong Vu, "Studying the State Through State Formation," *World Politics*, 62:1, 2010
- Dan Slater, *Ordering Power. Contentious Politics and Authoritarian Leviathans in Southeast Asia* (Cambridge University Press, 2010) pp. 55-114
- Daniel Ziblatt, *Structuring the State. The Formation of Italy and Germany and the Puzzle of Federalism* (Princeton University Press, 2006) pp.32-78

October 4, **Regime type**

- Barrington Moore, Jr., *Social Origins of Dictatorship and Democracy. Lord and Peasant in the Making of the Modern World*, 1966, Preface and Chs.1, 7-8
- Stephen E. Hanson, *Post-Imperial Democracies. Ideology and Party Formation in Third Republic France, Weimar Germany, and Post-Soviet Russia* (Cambridge University Press, 2010) pp.87-122

Supplementary:

- Samuel Valenzuela, on Moore, in Centeno and Alves, eds. *The Other Mirror*, pp.240-87

October 11, **Revolution** (re-schedule)

- Leon Trotsky, *History of the Russian Revolution* (Haymarket Books, 2008) pp. 13-39, 100-130, 708-39, 819-37
- Sewell, *Work and Revolution in France* (1980), Preface, pp.1-14, 62-91, 194-218
- Skocpol, *States and Social Revolutions: A Comparative Analysis of France, Russia, and China* (Cambridge, 1979), pp. xi-xvii, 3-40, 47-81
- William H. Sewell, Jr., "Ideologies and Social Revolutions: Reflections on the French Case," *Journal of Modern History*, 57:1, 1985, pp.57-85
- Skocpol, "Cultural Idioms and Political Ideologies in the Revolutionary Reconstruction of State Power: A Rejoinder to Sewell," *Journal of Modern History*, 57:1, 1985, pp.86-96

Supplementary:

- Kurt Weyland, "The Diffusion of Revolution: '1848' in Europe and Latin America," *International Organization*, 63:3, 2009, pp.391-423

Suggested:

- Jeffery M. Paige, *Coffee and Power: Revolution and the Rise of Democracy in Central America* (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1997)

October 18, **Variations on the iron cage**

- Norbert Elias, *The Civilizing Process*, 1939, pp. ix-xvi, 142-71, 363-82, 421-84
- Philip Gorski, *The Disciplinary Revolution*, 2003, pp.39-78, 114-55

Supplementary:

- Barrington Moore, Jr., *Reflections on the Causes of Human Misery*, 1969, Ch.1
- Orlando Patterson, *Slavery and Social Death*, 1982, Preface, Introduction, Chs.1-2
- Margaret Somers, "Citizenship and the Place of the Public Sphere," *American Sociological Review*, 58:5, 1993
- Margaret R. Somers, *Genealogies of Citizenship: Markets, Statelessness, and the Rights to Have Rights* (Cambridge University Press, 2008) pp.1-60
- Miguel Angel Centeno, on disciplinary society, in Centeno and Alves, eds. *The Other Mirror*, pp.289-308

Suggested:

- John Padgett and Christopher Ansell, "Robust Action and the Rise of the Medici, 1400-1434," *American Journal of Sociology*, 98:6, 1993
- George Steinmetz, *The Devil's Handwriting*, 2007

October 25, **Labor and Social Democracy I**

- Stefano Bartolini, *The Political Mobilization of the European Left 1860-1980: The Class Cleavage*, pp.206-39 (skim 312-410)
- Sheri Berman, *The Primacy of Politics. Social Democracy and the Making of Europe's Twentieth Century* (Cambridge University Press, 2006) pp.66-95

Supplementary:

- Ruth Berins Collier and David Collier, *Shaping the Political Arena: Critical Junctures, the Labor Movement, and Regime Dynamics in Latin America* (Princeton University Press, 1991) pp.3-39, 100-68
- Manali Desai, "From Movement to Party to Government: Why Social Policies in Kerala and West Bengal are so Different," in Jack Goldstone, ed. *States, Parties, and Social Movements* (Cambridge University Press) pp.170-96

November 1, **Labor and Social Democracy II**

- Ruth Berins Collier, *Paths Toward Democracy: The Working Class and Elites in Western Europe and South America* (Cambridge University Press, 1999) pp.166-98
- Richard Sandbrook et al., *Social Democracy in the Global Periphery* (Cambridge University Press, 2007) pp.65-92 (Kerala), 93-122 (Costa Rica), 123-46 (Mauritius)

November 8, **Political parties**

- Seymour Martin Lipset and Stein Rokkan, "Cleavage Structures, Party Systems, and Voter Alignments," in Peter Mair, ed. *The West European Party System* (Oxford University Press, 1990) pp.91-138
- Stathis Kalyvas, "From Pulpit to Party: Party Formation and the Christian Democratic Phenomenon," *Comparative Politics* 30:3, 1998, pp.293-312
- Stephen E. Hanson, *Post-Imperial Democracies. Ideology and Party Formation in Third Republic France, Weimar Germany, and Post-Soviet Russia* (Cambridge University Press, 2010) pp.87-122
- Daniele Caramani, *The Nationalization of Politics*, pp.154-91, 195-250
- John H. Aldrich, *Why Parties. The Origin and Transformation of Political Parties in America* (University of Chicago Press, 1995) pp.68-125

November 15, **Political regimes in interwar Europe**

- Gregory Luebbert, *Liberalism, Fascism, or Social Democracy: Social Classes and the Political Origins of Regimes in Interwar Europe* (Oxford University Press, 1991) pp.1-11, 55-109, 306-15
- Giovanni Capoccia, *Defending Democracy: Reactions to Extremism in Interwar Europe* (Johns Hopkins University Press, 2005) pp.179-220

November 22, **Nationalism and nation building**

-Liah Greenfeld, *Nationalism. Five Roads to Modernity* (Harvard University Press, 1992)
pp.27-51, 78-88, 133-84

-Reinhard Bendix, *Kings or People*, pp.321-77 (and skim 431-90 on Japan)

Suggested:

-Benedict Anderson, *Imagined Communities. Reflections on the Origins and Spread of Nationalism*. Revised Edition (Verso, 2006)

November 29, **Civil societies**

-Antonio Costa Pinto and Pedro Tavares de Almeida, "On Liberalism and the Emergence of Civil Society in Portugal; Alberto Mario Banti, "Public Opinion and Associations in Nineteenth-Century Italy;" Klaus Tenfelde, "Civil Society and the Middle Classes in Nineteenth-Century Germany;" Robert J. Morris, "Civil Society, Subscriber Democracies, and Parliamentary Government in Great Britain;" in Nancy Bermeo and Philip Nord, *Civil Society before Democracy. Lessons from Nineteenth-Century Europe* (Rowman and Littlefield Publishers, 2000) pp.3-21, 43-59, 83-108, 111-33